

5th High Level Seminar on Environmentally Sustainable Cities

Under the framework of the
East Asia Summit Environment Ministers Meeting

CHAIR'S SUMMARY

The 5th High Level Seminar on Environmentally Sustainable Cities (HLS ESC), organised by the Governments of Indonesia, Japan, Cambodia, the United States, the ASEAN Working Group on Environmentally Sustainable Cities (AWGESC) and the ASEAN Secretariat, was held in Surabaya, Indonesia on 28 February – 1 March 2014. The Seminar was chaired by Mr. Dana A. Kartakusuma (Assistant Minister for Global Environment, Ministry of Environment, Government of Indonesia) and co-chaired by Mr. Junichi Shiraishi (Vice Minister for Global Environmental Affairs, Ministry of the Environment, Government of Japan), Dr. Vann Momyneath (Deputy Director General for Technical Affairs, Ministry of Environment, Government of Cambodia/Chairperson, AWGESC) and Mr. Alfred Nakatsuma (Regional Environment Director, Regional Development Mission for Asia (RDMA), United States Agency for International Development (USAID)).

The Seminar brought together about 180 participants consisting of representatives from 15 national governments, 36 local authorities and 31 international organisations, non-government organisations (NGOs), research institutions, private companies and others for information exchange, knowledge sharing and frank discussion on the agenda of environmentally sustainable city development through Plenary and Thematic Sessions (Appendix A and B).

The Seminar recalled the main outputs of the previous HLS ESC and the progress made as follows:

- The 1st HLS ESC (2 – 4 March 2010, Jakarta, Indonesia) recommended the following activities as practical means for promoting ESC development in the region:
 - i. An East Asian 'Model Cities' Initiative;
 - ii. A clearinghouse for ESC-related data and information;
 - iii. A Public and Private Sector Forum on ESC;
 - iv. ESC Capacity Building Programme;
 - v. EAS ESC Awards based on performance indicators.

- **The 2nd HLS ESC (5 – 6 March 2011, Kitakyushu, Japan)** welcomed the implementation of the proposed ASEAN ESC Model Cities Programme, which was developed to follow up on the five recommended activities from the 1st HLS ESC. The programme was approved and commenced implementation a month later.
- **The 3rd HLS ESC (6 – 8 March 2012, Siem Reap, Cambodia)** reviewed the progress made in ESC across the region, showcased the achievements of Year 1 of the ASEAN ESC Model Cities Programme and warmly supported the continuation of the programme into its second year of implementation.
- **The 4th HLS ESC (21 – 22 March 2013, Ha Noi, Viet Nam)** presented the lessons learnt from the implementation of the ASEAN ESC Model Cities Programme (Year 1) and ideas for the programme's next phase. ASEAN Member States highlighted strategies and plans for initiating or enhancing country-based ESC Model Cities Programmes to serve as strategic 'building blocks' for the regional-level programme activities, while EAS participating countries and supporting organisations shared their ideas for collaborating with the ASEAN ESC Model Cities Programme.

The Seminar adopted this Chair's Summary as a record of the discussion and outcomes.

1) In the Opening Session:

- a) **Mr. Rasio Ridho Sani (Deputy Minister for Hazardous Substances, Hazardous Waste and Solid Waste Management, Ministry of Environment, Government of Indonesia)** provided an introduction to the background of the 5th HLS ESC. He highlighted the growing attention placed on cities and the future of urbanisation in global processes, such as the post-2015 development agenda, and noted the special importance of the HLS ESC's platform to help promote sustainable urbanisation in the region as ASEAN Member States approach entry into the ASEAN Community in 2015. The Government of Indonesia is implementing various national programmes targeting local authorities, schools, industries and the building sector to drive progress towards more holistic forms of urbanisation. The City of Surabaya is an example of how transformative leadership, multi-level and multi-stakeholder engagement as well as smart networking are being practised to realise sustainable urban development.
- b) **Mr. Junichi Shiraishi (Vice Minister for Global Environmental Affairs, Ministry of the Environment, Government of Japan)** highlighted Japan's strong desire to help ASEAN and Asian neighbours to realise a 'leapfrog' instead of a 'growth first, clean up later' approach to sustainable development, by sharing its past experiences in overcoming serious public pollution crises, as well as through the adoption of innovative and best-available Japanese

technologies for addressing environmental pollution. Japan is supporting the promotion of ESC through various regional cooperation initiatives in parallel with bilateral initiatives, including Joint Credit Mechanism (JCM) projects which are presently conducting feasibility studies in several Asian cities on climate change mitigation activities which will also aim at maximising 'co-benefits'. He also formally announced Japan's approval to extend funding support for Year 2 of the ASEAN ESC Model Cities Programme, in view of the programme's outstanding achievements in the 1st year, and in line with Japan's unwavering commitment to the ESC agenda.

- c) **Ms. Tri Rismaharini (Mayor, City of Surabaya, Indonesia)** delivered an inspiring keynote presentation on community-led initiatives in Surabaya City in achieving significant reductions in waste generation while increasing the amount of urban green space, using compost from organic waste. At the same time, this brought about large positive impacts in improving the health and hygiene of local communities. The transformation process has been gradual with the active involvement of local residents and supporting stakeholders. Recently, communities are beginning to apply decentralised wastewater treatment systems, resulting in improved water quality.

2) **From Plenary Session 1 'ASEAN ESC Model Cities Programme: Year 2' (Appendix D), the Seminar noted the following:**

- a) **Dr. Vann Momyneath (Chairperson, AWGESC)** started the session with **Introductory Remarks**. He gave an overview of AWGESC's background, current initiatives for promoting ESC and expressed appreciation to the Government of Japan for its valuable support in funding the ASEAN ESC Model Cities Programme, which is poised to begin implementation of Year 2 activities after the 5th HLS ESC. He outlined a vision for a longer-term approach of the ASEAN ESC Model Cities Programme to develop the programme into an ASEAN-led, demand-driven and multi-donor platform with a network to help mobilise assistance to outstanding and highly motivated ASEAN local governments for undertaking innovative and practical activities towards more sustainable development pathways.
- b) **ASEAN Member States** highlighted key national initiatives to promote ESC and initial ideas for supporting the implementation of Year 2 of the ASEAN ESC Model Cities Programme. These national initiatives consist of country-specific sustainable city indicators, guidelines, capacity building and incentive mechanisms (i.e. awards and financial rewards). Some of these initiatives have been linked to ASEAN initiatives such the ASEAN ESC Indicators and ASEAN ESC awards. These national programmes will be helpful to support the

implementation of Year 2 of the ASEAN ESC Model Cities Programme and they also offer rich opportunities for supporting organisations who wish to collaborate with ASEAN Member States on programmes related to sustainable cities.

3) In Plenary Session 2 'Challenges, Solutions and New Ideas for Promoting ESC' (Appendix E), the Seminar:

a) **Noted and appreciated** the national initiatives presented, as well as the discussion among panellists for furthering ESC development and their relevance to the ASEAN ESC Model Cities Programme and the ASEAN context. In summary:

- i. **Ms. Wang Xiaomi (Official, Ministry of Environmental Protection, Government of China)** explained how China has witnessed rapid urbanisation since the founding of the People's Republic of China in 1949, and also the adoption of opening-up and reform policy in 1978. China implemented a set of initiatives to improve the urban environment, such as Environmental Protection Target and Responsibility System, Urban Air Quality Reporting System, Quantitative Examination on Integrated Treatment of Urban Environment (QEITUE), National Model City for Environmental Protection (NMCEP), Pilot City for the Construction of Ecological Civilization (NPCCEC) etc. Furthermore, an index system has been established to create national environmental model cities in China with a multi-stakeholder participation framework. These initiatives have helped cities to significantly improve environment, strengthen local capacity and attract investments for green development. China's experience shows that the key elements for the improvement of urban environment include the establishment of a scientific and practical evaluation indicator system, a step-by-step approach to implement the evaluation indicator system, good planning of urban environmental protection, clear division of responsibilities and sufficient funding support.
- ii. **Ms. Sunita Singh (Director International Cooperation Division, Ministry of Environment & Forests, Government of India)** and **Mr. P.Bhagat Singh Superintending Engineer, Central Public Works Department, Ministry of Urban Development, Government of India)** explained the trend of converging policies among different line ministries towards the promotion of sustainable city development in India, and highlighted the particular importance of public transport. National rating and award schemes have been instrumental in driving actions to improve urban services and tackle environmental pollution. The cities of Gandhinagar, Gujarat (Solar City), Delhi Metro and Central Public Works Department (CPWD) have implemented pioneering initiatives in green, energy-efficient and Net Zero Energy buildings and

transport.

- iii. **Mr. Kotaro Kawamata (Director, International Cooperation Office, Ministry of the Environment, Government of Japan)** presented Japan's new financial support programmes for realising ESC. These programmes promote the introduction of advanced low-carbon technologies in developing countries in Asia, utilising the Joint Credit Mechanism (JCM). The need to create an enabling policy environment for advanced technologies – such as legislations, strict environmental standards and action plan – was emphasised. Furthermore, the importance of city-to-city cooperation (demonstrated by the cities of Kitakyushu and Surabaya, as well as Osaka and Ho Chi Minh) was also highlighted as a means to help ASEAN cities shift to more sustainable paths of development.
- iv. **Mr. Sang-Kap Kim (Director of the Urban Environmental Accords (UEA) Secretariat, Gwangju City, Republic of Korea)** introduced the UEA as a key initiative to promote ESC in the Republic of Korea and globally. In October 2011 Mayors and officials from over 80 cities met at the UEA Summit in Gwangju, Republic of Korea. They pledged to steer cities across the developed and developing world toward a green, resource-efficient and low-carbon trajectory. Based on the UEA Gwangju Declaration, the Secretariat has been developing the Urban Clean Development Mechanism (CDM) and the Urban Environmental Evaluation Index with the United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP) since 2011. In addition, Gwangju and the Secretariat co-developed the first stage of Green House Gas Projections & Diagnostics Program (GPD) in 2013 focusing on three major emission sources (electricity, gas and drinking water). The GPD aims to assist cities to prepare their GHG inventory at a macro and aggregated manner at the city-scale, develop baseline scenario, measure collective performance with a credible monitoring system, have systematic planning and quantitative data support for low-carbon city development, and access to climate finance opportunities. Gwangju and UEA have been further developing the GPD to include more emission sources and to be easily used at any cities in the world. The final output of GPD will be introduced at the next UEA Summit in 2015 in Iloilo City, Philippines.
- v. **Mr. Alfred Nakatsuma (Regional Environment Director, RDMA, USAID)** presented an update summarising one year of progress in USAID's Regional Asia Program since last year's HLS. For environmentally sustainable cities and urban climate change resilience he noted increasing quantities of analytical products, with relatively less implementation. USAID/Asia is focused on bridging analytics to implementation with efforts to promote creative financing, including its new partnership with the ADB, Rockefeller Foundation and UKAid's Urban Climate Change Resilience Trust Fund.

4) In Thematic Session A ('Urban Services'), the following key messages were derived from presentations and discussion (Appendix F):

a) Thematic Session A1 ('Waste Management', chaired by Mr. Lorenzo Santucci, Economic Affairs Officer, Environment and Development Division, United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific (ESCAP))

- i. Waste management is a key component of environmentally sustainable cities and cities in the region face a number of challenges in this regard, including growing amounts of waste due to rapid urbanisation, economic development and unavailability of land for final disposal.
- ii. These challenges can be overcome by adopting a 3R (reduce, reuse, recycle) approach, as experiences from participating cities show. Greater efforts are required to promote a paradigm shift in waste management, from traditional 'end-of-the-pipe' approaches to 'waste-to-resource'.
- iii. Technical solutions exist, such as recycling, composting and waste-to-energy. However, the separation of waste at source and community participation are essential for a successful waste management system. In this regard, the involvement of schools and youths can play a key role in driving behavioural change. National programmes promoting source separation and environmental education should be promoted.
- iv. Regional cooperation, including city-to-city cooperation, can play a key role in promoting sound waste management based on 3R principles.
- v. The EAS EMM should continue to promote sustainable solid waste management as part of its ESC work, and to facilitate partnerships, including public-private partnerships (PPPs), and city-to-city cooperation.

b) Thematic Session A2 ('Urban Water and Sanitation', chaired by Mr. Saengroaj Srisawaskraisorn, Climate Change Adaptation Specialist, RDMA, USAID)

- i. Many local governments face the challenge of meeting demands for adequate and improved urban water and sanitation services.
- ii. In response to this challenge, cities need to focus on both increasing the supply while also managing the increasing demands.
- iii. Development partners and bilateral governments play an active role in supporting cities to increase water and sanitation coverage through finance and technical capacity building.
- iv. Technological innovations, through private sector engagement, can ensure increased

access to water and sanitation services while also bringing co-benefits to cities in reducing GHGs emissions.

- v. Effective population control and behavior change are also important factors that will help lowering demands for water and sanitation services in cities.

c) Thematic Session A3 ('Resiliency', chaired by Mr. Saengroaj Srisawaskraisorn, Climate Change Adaptation Specialist, RDMA, USAID)

- i. Resilience is broadly defined as the ability to adapt, respond and grow.
- ii. Urban resilience requires an integrated system-based approach in sharing information, coordination and decision making to address socio-economic and environmental challenges.
- iii. Urban design and a broad-based participation approach help cities to build trust among relevant stakeholders, especially political leaders, and lower chance of failure for resilience activities.
- iv. Cities must develop urban adaptation pilots based on specific climate change issues and bring the successful pilots to scale through climate funds, private sector investment and national budget systems.
- v. Cities can share and learn innovative policies and practices from their peers to avoid repeating unnecessary mistakes through the city networks.
- vi. Small investments for city resilience projects may be financed by local sources; however, larger investments will require financial support from the national, international funds or private sector investment.
- vii. International development partners can support capacity to improve cities' readiness to access funds for larger resilience projects (e.g. construction of seawalls). Peer-to-peer learning remain an effective way to replicate success among cities.

5) In Thematic Session B ('Climate Change'), the following key messages were arrived at (Appendix G):

a) Thematic Session B1 ('Low Carbon Cities Part 1', chaired by Dr. Tadashi Matsumoto, Senior Policy Analyst, Regional Development Policy Division, Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) and co-chaired by Ms. Michie Kishigami, Director, ICLEI Japan)

- i. Low carbon actions at the city level need to be advanced from the strategy phase to actual implementation. The experience of Tokyo Metropolitan Government (introducing their Cap and Trade Programme), Iskandar Regional Development Agency (setting priorities in their Low Carbon Society (LCS) Blueprint) and Hai Phong

(raising public awareness and understanding in the process of Haiphong Urban Development to 2025) clearly illustrated the importance of political leadership and stakeholder engagement in order to advance low carbon plans and strategies into practice.

- ii. In order for cities to finance the implementation of plans and strategies, access to supporting mechanisms (e.g. financial support from foreign agencies and national governments) is key. The private sector can also play an important role in implementing solutions for low carbon cities (e.g. the use of smart technology, as illustrated in Yokohama).
- iii. It is also important to show evidence of programmes that have been implemented (such as LCS Blueprint in Iskandar Malaysia) in order to get broader private and public acceptance, trust and commitment to low carbon actions.

b) Thematic Session B2 ('Low Carbon Cities Part 2', chaired by Dr. Tadashi Matsumoto, Senior Policy Analyst, Regional Development Policy Division, Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) and co-chaired by Ms. Michie Kishigami, Director, ICLEI Japan)

- i. As presented by various supporting organisations (e.g. ADB, ICLEI, GEF) and the private sector (T.T. Network Infrastructure Japan Corp.), there are a number of supporting tools available for advancing the implementation of low carbon cities. However, few cities are aware of such opportunities and how to access them. There is an urgent need to make such tools more accessible, in particular to second- and third-tier cities in order to scale up actions for low carbon cities.
- ii. The case of city-to-city cooperation between Osaka City and Ho Chi Minh City illustrates that the JCM is a key supporting mechanism to facilitate the collaboration. It also highlights the need for cities to clearly identify their local challenges and opportunities, in order to find the 'best match', effective supporting mechanisms. Cities need continued efforts to get leaders committed and promote communication among stakeholders (including citizens) at the implementation stage.
- iii. Knowledge sharing among cities should be accelerated for scaling up pilot initiatives and for disseminating relevant information. In addition, knowledge sharing between cities and supporting agencies is crucial to ensure that the supporting tools developed by supporting agencies are made available to cities who need them the most, and also fit the local needs.

c) Thematic Session B3 ('Air Pollution & Transport', chaired by Mr. Robert Earley, Transport Program Manager, Clean Air Asia', and co-chaired by Ms. Dollaris Suhadi,

Executive Director, Swisscontact Indonesia)

- i. Even when good planning and public transit practices are put in place, emissions from vehicles themselves must be addressed, This may require local efforts in controlling emissions through better inspection and maintenance of vehicles as well as better freight management, and through national programmes, particularly standards that control the quality of second hand vehicles.
 - ii. Less resources (in terms of funding and expertise) are available to support small- and medium-sized cities. Hence, 'train the trainer' approach, regional exchange and cooperation among cities are helpful to effectively raise local capacity and scale up actions across countries.
 - iii. Finance is key to reducing emissions from transport. Innovative funding mechanisms that can properly address local needs and priorities, while offering reasonable assurance of emission reduction are required.
 - iv. The private sector is an important stakeholder in ensuring that transportation policies succeed. Raising general public awareness of transport air pollution emissions and the strict enforcement of standards and regulations are required to drive changes in the private sector.
 - v. Cities need to tie transport pollution measures to solid air quality monitoring programs in order to demonstrate the effectiveness of programs and ensure public support of further measures.
- 6) **In Thematic Session C ('Governance & Partnerships'), participants came up with the following key messages (Appendix H):**
- a) **Thematic Session C1 ('Governance and Public Participation Part 1', chaired by Dr. Bernadia Tjandradewi, Secretary General, United Cities and Local Governments, Asia-Pacific (UCLG-ASPAC) and co-chaired by Ms. Aisa Tobing, Deputy Secretary General, CITYNET)**
 - i. The key elements of good governance for sustainable cities and local governments include: building public participation, consistency between policies and action plans, integrated planning and bringing co-benefits of environmental management to address other sustainable development pillars, including culture.
 - ii. Partnerships among local governments are important keys to address social and economic challenges as well as the environment. Cooperation between citizens, government and the private sector should be based on win-win relationships for its sustainability.
 - iii. Local government has limited resources, therefore financing options and/or resource

mobilisation need to be developed to implement ESC.

b) Thematic Session C2 ('Governance and Public Participation Part 2', chaired by Dr. Bernadia Tjandradewi, Secretary General, United Cities and Local Governments, Asia-Pacific (UCLG-ASPAC) and co-chaired by Ms. Aisa Tobing, Deputy Secretary General, CITYNET)

- i. Environmental actions should be incorporated into government policies and not just implemented on a project-by-project basis.
- ii. Collaborative governance systems and networking are important to manage environmental problems, since environmental challenges transcend administrative boundaries.
- iii. The key success factors for addressing environmental problems are: building partnerships and trust, public participation in developing plans and implementation, transparency and accountability, as well as learning from other local governments through networking and peer-to-peer learning, as demonstrated by cities and local governments participating in the Partnership for Democratic Local Governance in Southeast-Asia (DELGOSEA) programme.
- iv. Solutions to environmental problems can also promote social and economic co-benefits, e.g. job creation, increased profits, sustainable consumption behaviour and preserving local traditional wisdom.

c) Thematic Session C3 ('ESC in CLMV¹', chaired by Mdm. Keobang A Keola, Director General of Pollution Control Department (PCD), Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment (MoNRE), Government of Lao PDR, and co-chaired by Mr. Susumu Shimura, JICA Expert, JICA LPP-Environmental Management (LPPE) Project)

- i. The 'National Guidelines for Environmentally Sustainable Cities (Lao_ESC_GL)'" elaborated by the PCD/MONRE with cooperation of JICA's LPP/LPPE is an efficient tool to realise the government's policy to encourage Laotian cities to be 'Clean, Green and Beautiful' so that they become environmentally sustainable without compromising the quality of life of the next generation.
- ii. The Lao_ESC_GL has played an instrumental role to operationalise the concepts of ESC in a tangible manner. Lao_ESC_GL strongly emphasises making the first, typically difficult steps towards ESC and offers flexibility to be adapted to cities of various sizes and different levels of development according to local priorities.
- iii. ESC is achievable only when all stakeholders agree on a future vision and the required actions. In this respect, Lao_ESC_GL promotes different local agencies

¹ Cambodia, Lao PDR, Myanmar and Viet Nam.

relevant to environmental sustainability to work together.

- iv. To actually operationalise the ESC concept, the PCD/MONRE has organised dissemination workshops of Lao_ESC_GL for 17 provincial capitals. Consequently 17 provincial capitals in Lao PDR have begun to formulate their Vision for ESC and 3 provincial cities are implementing the Vision for ESC together with LPP/LPPE.
 - v. The experience of operationalising ESC concept in Lao PDR is worth sharing with the other ASEAN cities to contribute to ASEAN ESC Model Cities initiative.
- 7) **In Plenary 3 'Reporting Back by Session Chairs', the Seminar noted the summary messages arising from all Thematic Sessions** that promising progress has been demonstrated by EAS national governments and cities in terms of research, policy innovation and pilot projects for ESC. However, the onset of climate change will require that we move from 'pilot projects' to widespread adoption. Looking forward, these efforts need to be spread and scaled up with urgency by all key stakeholders. This will require innovative techniques for awareness raising, capacity building and finance. Networks will be necessary in addition to city-to-city partnerships currently achieving effectiveness. Donors and the private sector's involvement in scaling up and spreading these practices will be necessary, and should be the focus of future efforts.
- 8) **In Plenary 4 'Recommendations for EAS EMM by Supporting Organisation', the Seminar noted the following messages from the following supporting organisations:**
- a) **ADB (Ms. Siti Hasanah, Senior Project Officer (Urban Development), Indonesia Resident Mission)** shared that implementation critical factors for enabling ESC lie in stakeholder coordination, adaptive management (where actions can be modified if needed, based on monitoring, evaluation of baseline data and citizen feedback), capacity building, project management, knowledge of funding sources and ability to raise capital as well as tools and database for monitoring implementation. Through its 'Asian Green Infrastructure Fund', ADB supports national and local governments to develop innovative finance mechanisms to ensure long-term implementation of the planned investments (15 – 20 years). ADB manages a number of specialist Green Funds, and one recent example is the Urban Climate Change Resilience Partnership (UCCRP), an innovative partnership among ADB, the British Government's Department for International Development and the Rockefeller Foundation. UCCRP aims to scale up the response to building urban climate change resilience in Asia by strengthening city-level planning systems, processes and multi-stakeholder engagement in 'climate smart' urban planning.
 - b) **CDIA (Mr. Joris Van Etten, Deputy Program Coordinator)** highlighted that cities often have macro-development strategies but city infrastructure projects are not related to them. Bridging the planning-financing gap requires city-wide investment planning and pre-feasibility project

structuring. CDIA supports the identification and development of urban investment projects that emphasise one or more of the following impact areas: environmental sustainability, pro-poor development, good governance and climate change. Local institutional capacity is strengthened through 'on-the-job training' related to infrastructure investment planning and programming as well as project development.

- c) **Clean Air Asia (Mr. Robert Earley, Transport Program Manager)** recommended that Environment Ministers should measure and report PM2.5 emission levels to the public. Measuring and reporting air quality has demonstrated ability to motivate change by both private and public sectors. Secondly, Ministers should support the development of participatory and science-based Clean Air Plans. A science-based approach ensures that the most important sources of pollution are addressed in an effective and economical way, while governments need the cooperation of all sectors to reduce air pollution. Thirdly, freight movement, being integral to the operation of cities and making disproportionate economic and social impacts, should be enhanced towards achieving improvements in environmental quality, road safety, supply chain performance and other aspects. Finally, transport systems should make space for non-motorised transport (pedestrian and cyclists), which prevents emissions and lessens cost of transportation for the poor.
- d) **CITYNET (Ms. Aisa Tobing, Deputy Secretary General)** presented CITYNET's background and mandate. She introduced CITYNET's three focus action areas: good urban governance through building trust, enabling 'sustainable greening city' as well as empowering partnership and collaboration. There is a need to raise awareness on sustainable consumption, where behaviour change is key. Major challenges faced by cities in greening cities include: financial matters (limited funds), lack of technical and institutional capacity (including to formulate policies and regulation as well as in setting priorities) as well as the overall lack of information and awareness. CITYNET helps to build networks and relationships for sharing best practices and fostering collaboration to support efforts for ESC.
- e) **German International Cooperation (GIZ) (Mr. Roland Haas, Programme Director, Clean Air for Smaller Cities)** submitted a written message on behalf of the German Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ), stating that GIZ continues to support medium-sized cities in the ASEAN Region in their efforts to improve air quality in cooperation with the ASEAN Secretariat. Also, together with the ASEAN Secretariat, a project is implemented on transport and climate change at regional and national level. An increasing potential for greenhouse gas and vehicle pollutants' emissions reduction is seen in the field of fuel economy and green freight considerations, including city logistics.
- f) **ICLEI- Local Governments for Sustainability (ICLEI) (Ms. Michie Kishigami, Director, Japan Office)** provided an update of the global and regional activities of ICLEI and outlines two major projects in the region. After consultations with many cities and experts, the World

Resources Institute (WRI), C40 Cities Climate Leadership Group (C40) and ICLEI are now preparing the 2nd version of the Global Protocol for Community Scale GHG Emissions. ICLEI will take the 2nd step of the concerted actions aiming at the standardisation of the protocol. ICLEI is ready to offer 'HEAT+', a GHG emission quantification and climate planning software for local governments, customise country versions and train the trainers in each country. Around 30 cities in India and Indonesia have already made their inventories using this software in this region. Local governments are invited to report their commitments, inventory, action plans and achievements to ICLEI's carbon Cities Climate Registry Framework. It is now the biggest database of local climate actions with more than 414 reports from 45 countries. Finally, ICLEI calls for more cooperation and collaboration of cities to create low carbon and resilient cities in this region.

- g) **IGES (Mr. Kazunobu Onogawa, Senior Fellow)** outlined IGES key activities in the area of ESC. Firstly, IGES has been facilitating coordination and cooperation among various stakeholders by serving as the secretariat of the HLS ESC,. IGES continues to help realise the recommendations of the 1st HLS ESC through the ASEAN ESC Model Cities Programme, which has just been extended into a 2nd year. This programme has helped to establish country-based ESC programmes in 8 ASEAN Member States and extended assistance to 14 cities. Recognising the common challenge of waste management in the region, IGES is contributing to the Regional 3R Forum for Asia and the Pacific through developing series of 3R key indicators. IGES is also planning to develop a Asia-Pacific Waste Management White Paper in collaboration with partners to help clarify current conditions and inform upcoming waste management strategies. Finally, IGES also supports the development of low-carbon projects in ASEAN cities, including Surabaya, Hai Phong and Bandung under JCM and through city-to-city cooperation.
- h) **JICA (Mr. Nobuhiro Ikuro, Deputy Director General, Environmental Management Group, Global Environment Department)** shared JICA's work in supporting the grand design of the Metro Cebu 2050 Vision as a case study ESC development for a metropolitan city. The project has three stages: 'analysis', 'vision' and 'targets & direction'. The Vision is built upon six attributes, namely: 'cultural & historic', 'innovative, creative & competitive', 'inclusive, equitable and livable', 'interconnected & compact', 'green' and 'integrated, coordinated & participative'. These 6 attributes guide the development of strategies and targets, which are seen as 'engines' to accelerate projects within the city.
- i) **OECD (Mr. Tadashi Matsumoto, Senior Policy Analyst, Regional Development Policy Division)** introduced the progress of the OECD Green Growth Programme, launched in 2010, which aims to propose effective green growth policy frameworks for cities by assessing the impact of urban green growth policies on urban and national performance through case studies in OECD and non-OECD cities. A total of four case studies for OECD cities (Paris,

Chicago, Kitakyushu and Stockholm) have been completed, with insightful findings. From 2013 – 2015, the programme will extend its scope to non-OECD cities, in particular to ASEAN Member States, China and India. The OECD is currently proposing a conceptual framework for urban green growth in fast growing Asian cities, and is going to conduct case studies in 4 – 6 non-OECD Asian cities and multi-city knowledge sharing activities.

- j) **UCLG-ASPAC (Dr. Bernadia Tjandradewi, Secretary General)** provided an overview of UCLG-ASPAC's three main initiatives to promote good urban governance, which are: 'DELGOSEA', 'Global Task Forces of Local and Regional Governments for Post 2015 Development Agenda' and 'Zero Waste'. DELGOSEA promotes transnational exchange of sustainable good governance practices through peer-to-peer learning, networking and cooperation amongst local government. On the post-2015 development agenda, UCLG-ASPAC is proposing the agenda of 'people-centred development' for inclusion into the Rio+20 outcome document that recognises local and authorities as key partners, as contribution to the UN High Level Panel. As for 'Zero Waste', UCLG-ASPAC is presently working with Bandung City, Indonesia, to improve solid waste management services and performance.
- k) **United Nations Centre for Regional Development (UNCRD) (Mr. Choudhury Rudra Charan Mohanty, Environment Programme Coordinator)** explained that the major activities of UNCRD that complements ESC include: 3Rs, EST (environmentally sustainable transport) and for IPLA (International Partnership for Expanding Waste Manage Services of Local Authorities) which is a Rio+20 partnership. Under the 3R initiative, the Hanoi 3R Declaration (2013 – 2023), agreed at the 4th Regional 3R Forum in 2013, provides an important basis and framework for Asia-Pacific countries to develop 3R policies and programmes at national and local level. Further, the Surabaya 3R Declaration agreed at the 5th Regional 3R Forum held on 25-27 Feb 2014 aims to promote multilayer partnership and coalition as the basis for advancing 3Rs in the region. Wastes and emissions are intrinsically linked with overall resource use; natural resources and ecological assets are being used at increasing rate enabling economic growth and fuelling the unprecedented growth of cities. The key messages that emerged from 5th 3R Forum as well as the Surabaya 3R Declaration can be accessed at the UNCRD website (http://www.uncrd.or.jp/env/spc/5th_3r_forum_f.htm).
- l) **ESCAP (Mr. Lorenzo Santucci, Economic Affairs Officer, Environment and Development Division)** outlined ESCAP's current work and future activities in support of environmentally sustainable cities. At the operational level, he highlighted ESCAP's work on low carbon green growth, waste management, urban nexus (water, energy and food security) and pro-poor and alternative building materials. He also highlighted recent analytical work on planning principles for green cities and announced that the second edition of the 'State of Asia-Pacific Cities Report' would be launched in October 2014. As a regional commission of the United Nations, ESCAP is also leading the regional consultations and preparatory work

for the post-2015 development agenda and the third United Nations Conference on Housing and Sustainable Urban Development (HABITAT III) to be held in 2016.

9) **The Seminar therefore:**

- a) **Recognised** that both **low carbon cities** and **urban resiliency** are emerging and increasingly critical key elements of overall sustainable city development.
- b) **Acknowledged that** in realising ESC, **promising progress has been demonstrated by EAS national governments and cities** in terms of research, policy innovation and pilot projects for ESC, and these **efforts need to be spread and scaled up with greater urgency** by all key stakeholders. However, there are many difficulties in moving cities from the analysis stage, onto the planning stage and the implementation stage.
- c) **Reaffirmed** that the active participation of relevant stakeholders must be fostered to formulate effective policies and practices for ESC.
- d) **Recommended EAS Environment Ministers to consider the following actions:**
 - i. **On broad policies and legal frameworks:**
 - Develop or enhance **national ESC guidelines and incentive programmes (such as national sustainable city award schemes)**, which encourage the development of **local action plans for realising low carbon cities** based on **scientific findings**, as well as the **integration of urban resilience into urban planning and urban services**. **Low carbon city policies should aim at maximising the 'co-benefits'** which arise from actions that mitigate global climate change and alleviate local environmental problems at the same time;
 - **Improve environment legislation and environmental standards** in order to facilitate the **adoption of advanced environmentally-friendly technologies** to improve local environmental quality, reduce carbon emissions and enhance urban resiliency;
 - **'Governance'** should be adopted as a **cross-cutting action area of cooperation under ESC development**, given that environmental issues transcend administrative boundaries and call for institutional coordination. Therefore, not only internal coordination within cities, but also with neighbouring municipalities is important.
 - ii. **On practical projects and actions under EAS collaboration on ESC:**

- **Cities and donors need to focus on financially-feasible project development and connect them to finance mechanisms.** Climate funds, private sector investment, national budgets and innovative financing, such as the Joint Crediting Mechanism, all need to be employed as sources of capital.
 - Governments, donors and academia should try to **devise methods to achieve success on a larger scale and more quickly than the current pace.** Effective 'one-on-one' as well as 'wholesale' approaches are needed, such as **training activities and knowledge sharing events** through the modality of **peer-to-peer partnerships and city-to-city cooperation.** **Networks and associations of practitioners** need to multiply these relationships to encourage and 'spread' and 'scale' of best practice adoption.
- e) **Requested** the Secretariat (IGES and/or ASEAN Secretariat as appropriate) to communicate to and report the Chair's Summary of the 5th HLS ESC and consult relevant stakeholders on possible ways forward at the following upcoming meetings:
- i. 12th Meeting of the ASEAN Working Group on Environmentally Sustainable Cities (AWGESC) to be held tentatively on 28 – 30 May 2014 in Thailand;
 - ii. 25th Meeting of the ASEAN Senior Officials on the Environment (ASOEN) which is planned to be held tentatively in August 2014 in Lao PDR;
 - iii. 13th ASEAN Plus Three Environment Ministerial Meeting to be held tentatively in September 2014 in Lao PDR;
 - iv. The forthcoming 5th EAS Environment Ministers Meeting;
 - v. Other relevant major meetings and seminars pertaining to ESC, including those under global processes such as the post-2015 development agenda and the preparations for the 3rd United Nations Conference on Housing and Sustainable Urban Development (HABITAT III, to be held in 2016) and to provide full support to their regional preparatory processes.

APPENDICES

Appendix A – Concept Note

Appendix B – Programme

Appendix C – List of Participants

Appendix D – Summary of Plenary Session 1

Appendix E – Summary of Plenary Session 2

Appendix F – Summary of Thematic Sessions A1, A2 and A3

Appendix G – Summary of Thematic Sessions B1, B2 and B3

Appendix H – Summary of Thematic Sessions C1, C2 and C3